The meeting was called to order at 10.30 a.m.

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE COMMITTEE TO THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY THROUGH THE ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL COUNCIL UNDER ARTICLE 45 OF THE COVENANT AND ARTICLE 6 OF THE OPTIONAL PROTOCOL (agenda item 7) (CCPR/C/45/CRP.1 and Addenda)

1. The CHAIRMAN invited the Committee to adopt its annual report to the General Assembly.

2. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur), introducing the draft annual report, pointed out that documents CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.17 and Add.23, which the Committee had planned to devote to the summary records relating to consideration of the initial report of Burundi, had not been prepared because Burundi had not presented its report to the Committee at its current session.

3. He also pointed out that annex VII, set out in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.29, should be entitled "Special decisions by the Human Rights Committee concerning reports of particular States parties", so as to follow as far as possible the wording adopted for the first time in the previous annual report (A/46/40), annex VI of which contained the Committee's decision concerning the third periodic report of Iraq.

4. Mrs. HIGGINS inquired which part of the report dealt with follow-up to the Committee's views under the Optional Protocol. She thought it vitally important for that matter to be covered in the report. The follow-up procedure had been instituted not only to enable the Committee to be accurately informed about the situation in each of the cases brought before it, but also for a more important reason: to enable States parties that had not been cooperative to be clearly identified.

5. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that the question of follow-up to the Committee's views was dealt with in chapter V, section G, of the draft report (CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25). He said that section G would have to be duly completed along the lines of chapter V, section I, of the previous annual report (A/46/40, paras. 701-704). The situation was different, however, in the case of the current annual report, since the Special Rapporteur for the follow-up of views, Mr. Fodor, had been unable to participate in the current session of the Committee, which consequently had not received information from the Special Rapporteur on the cases he was following up. In the circumstances, he proposed that the Secretariat should be authorized to make contact with Mr. Fodor, who could transmit the requisite information, which would then appear in the Committee's next report.

6. Mrs. HIGGINS said she thought the Committee could easily authorize the Secretariat, acting in cooperation with Mr. Ando, to obtain the required information from Mr. Fodor; it could then be incorporated direct into the current annual report.

7. The CHAIRMAN said that Mrs. Higgins' proposal seemed fully acceptable. He invited the Committee to consider, in order, the various chapters of the draft annual report.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1

Paragraph 1

8. The CHAIRMAN, referring to the second line of paragraph 1, pointed out that 112 States, not 111, had ratified the Covenant as at 31 July 1992. Moreover, the number of States mentioned in the ninth line of paragraph 1 should be 36, not 34.

9. Paragraph 1, as orally amended, was adopted.

Paragraphs 2-5

10. Paragraphs 2-5 were adopted.

Paragraph 6

11. Mrs. KLEIN (Secretary of the Committee) said that the penultimate sentence of paragraph 6 should read: "All the members attended the forty-fifth session except Messrs. Fodor, Serrano Caldera and Wako". It should be followed by a sentence worded: "Messrs. Dimitrijevic, Lallah and Mavrommatis attended only part of that session".

12. Paragraph 6, as supplemented orally by Mrs. Klein, was adopted.

Paragraphs 7 and 8

13. Paragraphs 7 and 8 were adopted.

Paragraph 9

14. Mr. AGUILAR URBINA pointed out that Mr. Fodor had not taken part in the work of the Working Group on Communications and that his name should therefore be deleted from the eleventh line of paragraph 9.

15. The CHAIRMAN said that, since the Working Group had taken decisions about the admissibility of communications and he himself had taken part in at least one of its meetings, his name should be mentioned in connection with the work of the Working Group, by means of wording which the Rapporteur could be left to decide upon.

16. Miss CHANET noted that the Working Group of the forty-third session, of which she had been Chairman/Rapporteur, had been composed not of Messrs. El Shafei, Lallah, Ndiaye and Prado Vallejo but of Messrs. Müllerson, Prado Vallejo, Sadi and Wennergren.

17. The CHAIRMAN said that the requisite amendments would be made to paragraph 9.

18. Paragraph 9, as orally amended, was adopted.

Paragraph 10

19. Paragraph 10 was adopted.

Paragraphs 11-19

20. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that he had circulated to members of the Committee a draft text of two paragraphs which might be added after paragraph 19, under the heading "Forty-fifth session". He had also circulated the text of a new paragraph, on the subject of staff resources, which could constitute a new section G.

21. The CHAIRMAN said that the Committee could adopt paragraphs 11-19, and any possible additional paragraphs, when it had studied the texts circulated by the Rapporteur.

Paragraphs 20 and 21

22. Paragraphs 20 and 21 were adopted, subject to any requisite renumbering and to the additions by the Secretariat.

New paragraphs 20 and 21 (Forty-fifth session)

23. The CHAIRMAN invited the members of the Committee to consider the text of the two new paragraphs to be inserted after paragraph 19 under the heading "Forty-fifth session". The text, available in English only, read:

> "20. The Committee was informed by the Under-Secretary-General for Human Rights, who was addressing the Committee for the first time in that capacity, that the World Conference on Human Rights convened pursuant to General Assembly resolution 45/155 of 18 December 1990 would take place in Vienna from 14 to 25 June 1993. Preparatory activities were under way and human rights treaty bodies were encouraged to formulate further comments and suggestions in that regard. The fourth meeting of persons chairing the human rights treaty bodies which would meet in Geneva from 12 to 16 October 1992 would provide a further opportunity to the treaty bodies for coordination regarding the World Conference.
>
> "21. The Under-Secretary-General for Human Rights also informed the Committee of other significant developments of relevance to its work that had occurred since the Committee's forty-fourth session, notably the activities of the Committee against Torture and the preliminary work being undertaken by the Commission on Human Rights on an Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment. He also referred to a number of recent human rights events carried out under the programme of advisory services and technical assistance in the field of human rights, including assistance in drafting States parties' reports under international human rights instruments. The Under-Secretary-General also paid tribute to the valuable efforts of the Committee to encourage the protection of fundamental civil and political rights."

24. New paragraphs 20 and 21 were adopted.

New section G: Staff resources

25. The CHAIRMAN invited the Committee to consider the new text to be inserted under a possible new section G, entitled "Staff resources". The text, available in English only, read:

> "The greater complexity and more intensive pace of the Committee's operations, resulting from the increased number of States parties to the Covenant as well as from qualitative changes in the Committee's methods of work, has added significantly to the secretariat's workload in providing substantive servicing to the Committee. [The number of communications submitted to the Committee under the Optional Protocol has also grown markedly, partly as a result of the growth in the number of States parties to the Optional Protocol and because of an increased awareness of the Committee's activities under the Optional Protocol.] The Committee therefore requests the Secretary-General to consider the possibility of increasing substantially the number of staff assigned to service its operations."

26. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that the sentence within square brackets, which referred to the increase in the number of communications and the associated work, reflected a point already expressed in that part of the annual report, namely, paragraph 9 of document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25, which dealt with consideration of communications. It was for the Committee to decide whether it preferred to delete the sentence shown within square brackets in the current section and retain paragraph 9 of document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25, or vice versa. It seemed that the Secretariat would wish the need to increase the number of staff working for the Committee to be mentioned in the part of the report which dealt with communications.

27. Miss CHANET said she would like it to be said that, in view of the growing number of States parties to the Covenant and signatories to the Optional Protocol, and the changes in the Committee's methods of work, all of which implied an additional workload for the Secretariat, and in view also of the growth in the number of communications, the Centre for Human Rights should be provided with qualified staff well versed, inter alia, in the law of European States, on the one hand, and the law of Spanish-speaking States, on the other. She herself would not draw a distinction between staff members involved in the consideration of State party reports and those dealing with communications, and thought that an increase in the number of staff should be requested for both tasks.

28. Mr. PRADO VALLEJO said that he shared Miss Chanet's view.

29. Mr. HERNDL said that he was in favour of maintaining paragraph 9 in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25. With regard to the sentence within square brackets in the new text to be inserted in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1, he would prefer a stronger wording than that of the last sentence, in which the Committee would request the Secretary-General to consider the possibility of increasing substantially the number of staff. If the Committee wished to obtain satisfaction it should make its requests clear, as indeed was the case in the last sentence of paragraph 9 in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25. If the sentence within square brackets was retained, it should be shortened so as to say simply that the number of communications submitted to the Committee under

the Optional Protocol had also grown markedly; and it should be accompanied by a footnote referring, by way of further information, to paragraph 9 of document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25.

30. Mrs. HIGGINS said that she was in favour of keeping the sentence included within square brackets but was concerned that, as a result, the staffing requirements of the service which dealt with consideration of State party reports might be pushed into the background. She therefore proposed the addition of the words "in relation to the monitoring of reports" at the end of the first sentence of the proposed new paragraph, or the inclusion of wording, at the end of the last sentence, to the effect that an increase was requested in the number of staff assigned to the Committee, "both in relation to monitoring of reports and the Optional Protocol".

31. Following an exchange of views in which Mr. LALLAH, Mr. ANDO, Mr. HERNDL, Mr. SADI and Mr. AGUILAR URBINA took part, the CHAIRMAN invited the Rapporteur to draw up a text which would embody the strongest wording of paragraph 9 in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.25 and reflect the various suggestions that had been made.

32. It was so decided.

33. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1, with the new texts to be inserted, and subject to the revisions to be included by the Rapporteur, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.1

34. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.1 was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.2

Paragraphs 1-12

35. Paragraphs 1-12 were adopted.

Paragraph 13

36. Mrs. KLEIN (Secretary of the Committee) said that Hungary and Mexico should be added to the list of countries from which core documents had been received.

37. Paragraph 13, as supplemented by Mrs. Klein, was adopted.

New paragraph 13 bis

38. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) read out the text of a new paragraph which reflected a proposal made by the Chairman during the current session and approved by the Committee. The new paragraph would read: "At its 1167th meeting, held on 24 July 1992, the Committee took note with concern of the large number of States parties whose reports under article 40 of the Covenant were overdue, despite many appeals and reminders (see annex IV). Noting that this hampered the Committee's ability to monitor the implementation of the Covenant, the Committee requested the Secretary-General to bring the matter to the attention

of the twelfth meeting of States parties to be held at United Nations Headquarters in New York on 10 September 1992, for appropriate action."

39. The new paragraph 13 bis was adopted.

Paragraphs 14-16 (Consideration of reports)

40. Mrs. HIGGINS referred to paragraph 15, which mentioned "comments ... reflecting the views of the Committee as a whole at the end of the consideration of each State party report", a new form of words adopted by the Committee. She said that, for the sake of clarity, she would like to see the addition of a sentence to the effect that those comments "would be in addition to and not replace the comments made by individual members at the end of the consideration of reports".

41. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) accepted that amendment.

42. Paragraphs 14-16, with the amendment proposed by Mrs. Higgins, were adopted.

Paragraph 17

43. Paragraph 17 was adopted.

44. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.2, as amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.3 (Morocco)

Paragraphs 1-28

45. The CHAIRMAN said, in reply to a question by Mrs. HIGGINS, that account had been taken, in the document under consideration, of the Committee's deliberations, at its forty-third session, on the second periodic report of Morocco. He recalled that consideration of that report had begun, however, at the fortieth session, in 1990; naturally, therefore, the members of the Committee would not find, in the document before them, a complete account of everything that had been said or done in regard to the Morocco report. The text of paragraph 1 should perhaps be reworded in order to make matters clearer. The Committee would entrust that task to the Rapporteur.

46. Paragraphs 1-28 were adopted.

Paragraphs 29-31 (Concluding observations)

47. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that it was customary to have the Chairman's observations at the conclusion of the consideration of a State party report reflected in the annual report of the Committee. In order to fill the gap on that point in the document under consideration, he proposed the addition, under the heading "Concluding observations", of the following paragraph 32, which he read out: "In concluding the consideration of the second periodic report of Morocco, the Chairman thanked the delegation for its cooperation. He emphasized the importance of constant reviews of domestic legislation and practice to meet the requirements of the Covenant and stated that the dialogue with the Committee

should be utilized for that purpose." That text broadly reflected the comments made by the Chairman as they appeared in the relevant summary record.

48. He added that, in the English text of the fourth line of paragraph 30, the word "certain" should be added after the words "application of".

49. Mr. AGUILAR URBINA said that, first of all, he would prefer to see the term "Sahrawis" rather than "Western Saharans" used in paragraph 30. He also wondered whether the closure of Tazmamart prison should be mentioned in paragraph 29, which referred to the matters on which the members of the Committee had expressed satisfaction. He seemed to recollect that the members of the Committee had referred to the fact that the prison had been demolished but that the Moroccan delegation had denied the prison's very existence.

50. Mr. SADI said he would like it to be made clear, in paragraph 29, that the reference to the improvement of the situation of the Oufkir family was to be understood from the human rights standpoint.

51. Miss CHANET said she wondered whether it could be asserted that the Committee, during its consideration of the report of Morocco, had indeed expressed satisfaction about the closure of the Tazmamart prison, since that question was still a matter of concern to public opinion. It had been questioned whether the prison had really been closed; moreover, the Moroccan delegation had not even been willing to recognize the existence of that place. If the Committee, on the strength of the information available at the time, had indeed welcomed the closure, the report should say so, but if the Committee had not expressed any particular satisfaction on that point, any implication that it had must be avoided.

52. With regard to the Oufkir family, she clearly recollected that the improvement of its situation had been noted with satisfaction.

53. Mr. SADI said that he, too, thought that greater care should be taken in mentioning the matter of Tazmamart prison, the more so since the Moroccan authorities had never acknowledged its existence.

54. In paragraph 29, the adjective "liberal", employed to describe the attitude towards the Jewish community, was not in line with human rights terminology and should be replaced by a more precise term.

55. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said he noted, on reading the relevant summary record, that some members of the Committee had indeed raised the question of Tazmamart prison in their concluding observations, but had done so to reiterate their concerns, not to express satisfaction that the institution had been closed.

56. Mr. AGUILAR URBINA said that, if that was so, the concern should be reflected not in paragraph 29 but in paragraph 30, where the matters which disquieted the Committee were summarized. For that matter, the latter had voiced concern about the subject of the country's prisons in general, and there was no need to mention one in particular.

57. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that the matters for concern mentioned in paragraph 30 included unacknowledged prisons; in his view, that reference would suffice and it should therefore be possible to delete from paragraph 29 the reference to the closure of Tazmamart prison.

58. It was so decided.

59. Mr. PRADO VALLEJO said that he would like the text to read "the existence of unacknowledged prisons" rather than "unacknowledged prisons" in the third line of paragraph 30. In the same paragraph on page 12, he would like the end of the first sentence to be amended to read: "... the Western Saharans, and the difficult position of the Baha'i community and restrictions on freedom of religion in general".

60. Mr. Prado Vallejo's proposals were adopted.

61. Paragraphs 29-31, as orally amended, were adopted.

62. Mr. WENNERGREN said he would like the presence of a television team to be reflected in the annual report. That point could appear in chapter I, section G, of the draft report (CCPR/C/45/CRP.1), on the subject of publicity for the work of the Committee.

63. The CHAIRMAN pointed out that television teams were present on various occasions during the Committee's deliberations; he felt that there was no need to mention the fact each time.

64. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) recalled that there was clearly a difference in the case of consideration of the report of Morocco, since the Moroccan delegation had objected to the presence of television cameras at the July session. The fact that the delegation had refused to have its report considered by the Committee in the presence of a television team was referred to, albeit in neutral terms, in paragraph 229 of the Committee's previous annual report (A/46/40).

65. Miss CHANET said that, although she understood Mr. Wennergren's concern, she did not see any need to mention the presence of television, since that had become a common occurrence. If the Committee felt there was a problem of substance to be settled in regard to the presence of television at its meetings, it should hold a general discussion and perhaps lay down some rules. Having said that, it was true that the three-phase sequence in which the report of Morocco had been considered did not emerge clearly enough from the draft report, and perhaps, as the Chairman had suggested, paragraph 1 of document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.3 could be expanded so as to make it clear that the further continuation, at the forty-third session, of the report of Morocco had been pursuant to a decision taken by the Committee at its forty-second session, as reflected in its annual report.

66. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that he would elaborate on paragraph 1 of addendum 3 so as to give a clear picture of the chain of events which had led to a three-phase consideration of the report. He still thought that the question of television need not be raised.

67. The CHAIRMAN said that, if there was no objection, he would take it that the Committee would leave it to the Rapporteur to amend paragraph 1.

68. It was so decided.

69. Mr. EL SHAFEI said he took it that Mr. Wennergren's intention had been to raise the question of television not in the chapter dealing with consideration of the report of Morocco but in the section of chapter I which dealt with publicity for the work of the Committee. That could easily be done by adding, in the second sentence of paragraph 20 in document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1, the words "including television" after the words "the media".

70. The proposal was adopted.

71. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.3, as orally amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.4 (Austria)

Paragraphs 1 and 2

72. Paragraphs 1 and 2 were adopted.

Paragraphs 3-8

73. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that, in the first sentence of paragraph 4 in the English text, the adjective "national" should be replaced by "domestic".

74. Paragraphs 3-8, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 9-12

75. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that, in the fourth line of paragraph 9, the words "the various sectors" should be followed by "of society".

76. Paragraphs 9-12, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 13-16

77. Paragraphs 13-16 were adopted.

Paragraphs 17-24

78. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) drew attention to two amendments to paragraph 20, in the English text only. In the penultimate sentence, the word "against" should be added after "appealed" and, in the next sentence, the phrase "the average of pre-trial detention" should read: "the average length of pre-trial detention".

79. Paragraphs 17-24, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 25-30

80. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) pointed out an amendment to the English text of paragraph 26. In the second sentence, the phrase following the comma should read: "especially since the introduction of the monitoring system in 1990".

81. Paragraphs 25-30, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 31-40

82. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that, in the last sentence of paragraph 32 in the English text, the verb "wondered" was to be replaced by "asked".

83. The beginning of the first sentence of paragraph 35 should be amended to read: "the radio and television enterprise was not a State monopoly but was a separate broadcasting authority ...". In the second sentence of that paragraph, in the English text, the word "against" should again be added after "appealed".

84. Paragraphs 31-40, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 41-45

85. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that the third sentence in paragraph 42 of the draft report should be amended to read: "It was noted, in particular, that, as far as grounds for discrimination were concerned, Austrian law was not in complete conformity with the provisions of the Covenant".

86. Mr. MÜLLERSON, referring to the second sentence of paragraph 42, said he thought it necessary to avoid linking the question of the status of the Covenant in relation to Austrian law with the point about lack of protection for certain rights. If certain rights lacked adequate protection, that was not owing to the degree of importance accorded to the Covenant. It would be better to delete the sentence.

87. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that he could accept Mr. Müllerson's proposal. The reason for the sentence was that, in Austria, the European Convention on Human Rights was strictly incorporated into domestic law, whereas the situation with regard to the Covenant was extremely vague. Although most of the Covenant's provisions were perfectly reflected in the European Convention, some of its articles, article 26 for example, had no equivalent, which meant that certain problems could arise. That was why the Committee had voiced its concern.

88. Mr. HERNDL proposed that part of the sentence should be retained and that the clause "which left certain rights without adequate legal protection" should be deleted.

89. The proposal was adopted.

90. Paragraphs 41-45, as orally amended, were adopted.

91. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.4, as orally amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.5 (Poland)

Paragraphs 1-4

92. Paragraphs 1-4 were adopted.

Paragraphs 5-13

93. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) drew attention to an amendment to the first sentence in paragraph 7: the phrase "despite the non-conformity of article 81 of the Constitution with the Covenant on that issue" should be reworded: "despite the discrepancy between them and the provisions of article 81 of the Constitution".

94. Paragraphs 5-13, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 14-16

95. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur), referring to the penultimate sentence of paragraph 16, said that, there again, the word "against" should be added after the word "appealed".

96. Paragraphs 14-16, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 17-19

97. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that, in paragraph 18, the phrase "including on the basis of sex" should be replaced by "including one based on sex".

98. Paragraphs 17-19, as orally amended, were adopted.

Paragraphs 20-58

99. Paragraphs 20-58 were adopted.

100. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.5, as orally amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.6 (Iraq)

Paragraphs 1-31

101. Paragraphs 1-31 were adopted.

Paragraphs 32-37 (Concluding observations)

102. Mrs. HIGGINS said she thought that, although the situation regarding implementation of the Covenant had improved in Iraq, progress hitherto had been limited and, in paragraph 32, the Committee could not speak of "allowing the establishment of political parties". She proposed that those words should be replaced by "moves towards permitting political parties".

103. Paragraphs 32-37, with the oral amendment to paragraph 32, were adopted.

104. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.6, as orally amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.7 (Ecuador)

Paragraphs 1-41

105. Paragraphs 1-41 were adopted.

Paragraphs 42-45 (Concluding observations)

106. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) said that, since it was already stated, in the first sentence of paragraph 38, that the right to vote had not been granted to members of the police and the armed forces, he proposed that the reference, at the end of the second sentence of paragraph 43, to members of the police and the armed forces should be deleted. If, however, the members of the Committee wished to retain a reference to denial of the right to vote in regard to persons in those categories, the end of the second sentence could be amended to read: "the prohibition against women signing contracts to work abroad; various discriminatory provisions of the Election Act with regard to the illiterate and the elderly; and the prohibition of the right to vote to members of the police and the armed forces".

107. Mr. PRADO VALLEJO said that, in his view, that amendment would improve the second sentence of paragraph 43 considerably. It could not be deemed, however, that the illiterate and the elderly were victims of discrimination under the Election Act in Ecuador, in that such persons were able to vote and stand for election. What the passage said was therefore incorrect, and it should be deleted.

108. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) referred the members of the Committee to paragraphs 35 and 37, in which it was stated that voting was compulsory except for those who were illiterate or aged over 65. If the members of the Committee as a whole felt that the wording of paragraph 35 was correct, that part of paragraph 43 relating to the illiterate and the elderly could be deleted.

109. It was so decided.

110. Mr. El SHAFEI said that he would likewise prefer the deletion of the first part of the third sentence in paragraph 43 ("the right to vote should not be a duty and"), which was directly connected to the end of the preceding sentence. The two parts of that third sentence had no common link and should at least be separated, even if it was decided to retain the first part.

111. Mrs. HIGGINS said that the first part of the third sentence, as worded, implied an opinion shared by all the members of the Committee. She would prefer it to read "certain members also felt". She also pointed out that the right to vote was a duty in a very large number of countries, a fact that the Committee should not overlook.

112. Mr. EL SHAFEI agreed with Mrs. Higgins.

113. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) suggested that the first part of the third sentence, relating to the obligation to vote, should be deleted.

114. It was so decided.

115. Paragraphs 42-45, with the oral amendments to paragraph 43, were adopted.

116. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.7, as orally amended, was adopted.

Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.8 (Algeria)

Paragraphs 1-24

117. Paragraphs 1-24 were adopted.

Paragraphs 25-28 (Concluding observations by members of the Committee)

118. Mr. HERNDL said he seemed to recollect that the Committee had decided, at its previous session, to devote a special chapter of its annual report to the comments of the Committee as a whole in regard to the reports submitted by States parties. That measure should be applied in respect of all State party reports submitted at the forty-fourth session and subsequently. He would therefore like to see added, after paragraph 28, a paragraph referring to those comments and indicating that they would appear in a separate chapter. Such a reference should be included at the end of each summary of the consideration of a State party report, beginning with the one relating to the initial report of Algeria.

119. The CHAIRMAN and Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) endorsed Mr. Herndl's opinion, and proposed that paragraph 28 should include a footnote reference to the chapter which contained the comments by the Committee as a whole on the report submitted by the State party.

120. Mr. LALLAH said that, since he had not attended the Committee's previous session, he was not clear as to which part of the annual report would contain the comments of the Committee as a whole. Having said that, he stressed that those comments were quite general and minimalist. It was highly important, therefore, that States parties, as well as the media, non-governmental organizations and others should read them in conjunction with the concluding observations of the various members of the Committee. To that end the comments of the Committee as a whole should immediately follow the summary of the consideration of the report of the State party concerned.

121. Miss CHANET said that she fully agreed with Mr. Lallah, and that his suggestion should be adopted and put into effect beginning with the current annual report.

122. Mr. ANDO (Rapporteur) suggested the addition, in paragraph 15 of document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.2, of a sentence to indicate that the comments in question should be read together with those contained in the summary of consideration of the report by the State party concerned, particularly those set out in the section entitled "Concluding observations by members of the Committee".

123. Mrs. HIGGINS said she supported the proposal to put the comments immediately after the concluding observations by members of the Committee. She also urged that the proposal should be taken into consideration not only in the annual report but also in the relevant texts to be sent to the State party concerned, to the media, and so on.

124. She proposed that the phrase "concluding observations by individual members of the Committee" should be used.

125. The CHAIRMAN said he took it that there was agreement in favour of inserting the comments of the Committee as a whole immediately after the last paragraph, relating to the concluding observations by members of the Committee, in order that the reader would have all the subject-matter in one place. He would leave it to the Secretariat to give effect to the Committee's decision in the various relevant texts, by means of appropriate drafting changes.

126. It was so decided.

127. Paragraphs 25-28, as orally amended, were adopted.

128. Document CCPR/C/45/CRP.1/Add.8, as orally amended, was adopted.

The meeting rose at 1 p.m.